

# United States Patent and Trademark Office

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO
10/092,300	03/07/2002	Ho-Jin Kweon	1567.1027	2618
49455	7590 09/12/2005		EXAM	INER
•	EWEN & BUI, LLP		ALEJANDRO,	RAYMOND
1400 EYE ST SUITE 300	REET, NW		ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
	ON, DC 20005		1745	

DATE MAILED: 09/12/2005

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

				/
		Application No.	Applicant(s)	
		10/092,300	KWEON ET AL.	
	Office Action Summary	Examiner	Art Unit	
	•	Raymond Alejand	ro 1745	
Period fo	The MAILING DATE of this communication ap	pears on the cover	sheet with the correspondence a	address
A SH WHI( - Exte after - If NC - Failt Any	ORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLICATION OF THE MAILING INTERIOR OF THE MAILING OF T	DATE OF THIS CO .136(a). In no event, hower I will apply and will expire S te, cause the application to	MMUNICATION. /er, may a reply be timely filed  IX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).	
Status				
1)  🏹	Responsive to communication(s) filed on 12 /	August 2005	·	
2a)□		is action is non-fina	l	
·	Since this application is in condition for allowa			he merits is
,—	closed in accordance with the practice under			
Disposit	ion of Claims		,	
· -				
4)⊠	Claim(s) <u>1,2,5,10,11,13,15-23,32,34,35,38 ar</u>	· ·	• •	
-,-	4a) Of the above claim(s) <u>15-23,32,34 and 35</u>	is/are withdrawn fr	om consideration.	
·	Claim(s) is/are allowed.		•	
	Claim(s) <u>1,2,5,10,11,13,38 and 39</u> is/are reject	cted.		
	Claim(s) is/are objected to.			
. 8)	Claim(s) are subject to restriction and/	or election requiren	nent.	
Applicat	ion Papers			
9)	The specification is objected to by the Examin	er.		
	The drawing(s) filed on <u>07 March 2002</u> is/are:		h)□ objected to by the Examin	er
/-	Applicant may not request that any objection to the		•	<b>.</b>
4	Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correct			CED 1 121(d)
11)	The oath or declaration is objected to by the E			
	ınder 35 U.S.C. § 119			10 102.
_	· ·			
	Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreig	n priority under 35	U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).	
a)	All b)    Some * c)    None of:      A     Some * c    Some * c    C			
	1. Certified copies of the priority documen			
	2. Certified copies of the priority documen			
	3. Copies of the certified copies of the prior	-		al Stage
	application from the International Burea		**	
* \$	See the attached detailed Office action for a lis	t of the certified co	pies not received.	
Attachmen	t(s)			
	e of References Cited (PTO-892)		nterview Summary (PTO-413)	
	e of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)		'aper No(s)/Mail Date Notice of Informal Patent Application (P	TO 152\
	nation Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08 r No(s)/Mail Date	_	Notice of Informal Patent Application (P Other:	10-192)
J.S. Patent and T PTOL-326 (R		Action Summary	Part of Paper No./Mail	 Date 20050906

Me

Application/Control Number: 10/092,300 Page 2

Art Unit: 1745

#### **DETAILED ACTION**

## Continued Examination Under 37 CFR 1.114

A request for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, including the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e), was filed in this application after final rejection. Since this application is eligible for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, and the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e) has been timely paid, the finality of the previous Office action has been withdrawn pursuant to 37 CFR 1.114. Applicant's submission filed on 08/12/05 has been entered.

This office paper is responsive to the amendment accompanying the foregoing RCE. The applicants have overcome the 35 USC 112 rejection. Refer to the abovementioned amendment for substance of applicant's rebuttal arguments. However, the present claims stand rejected as all the double patenting rejections and the 35 USC 103 rejection are herein maintained for the reasons of record. Moreover, additional art rejections are also presented infra. Thus, the instant application is again rejected as seen hereinbelow:

### Election/Restrictions

- 1. This application contains claims 15-23, 32 and 34-35 drawn to an invention nonelected with traverse in Paper No. 12/05/03. A complete reply to this rejection must include cancellation of nonelected claims or other appropriate action.
- 2. Cancellation of claims 3, 6, 14, 24 and 33 is acknowledged.

# Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102

3. The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless -

(e) the invention was described in (1) an application for patent, published under section 122(b), by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent or (2) a patent granted on an application for patent by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent, except that an international application filed under the treaty defined in section 351(a) shall have the effects for purposes of this subsection of an application filed in the United States only if the international application designated the United States and was published under Article 21(2) of such treaty in the English language.

Page 3

4. Claims 1-2, 5, 10-11 and 13 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as being anticipated by Kweon et al 2002/0071990.

The applied reference has common inventors with the instant application. Based upon the earlier effective U.S. filing date of the reference, it constitutes prior art under 35 U.S.C. 102(e). This rejection under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) might be overcome either by a showing under 37 CFR 1.132 that any invention disclosed but not claimed in the reference was derived from the inventor of this application and is thus not the invention "by another," or by an appropriate showing under 37 CFR 1.131.

The present claims are drawn to a positive active material composition wherein the disclosed inventive concept comprises the specific additive compound.

#### As to claims 1 and 10:

Kweon et al disclose a positive active material for a rechargeable battery including a core and a surface treatment layer thereon (ABSTRACT/SECTION 0046); the core includes at least one lithiated compound and the surface treatment layer includes at least one coating material selected from the group consisting of coating element included-hydroxides, oxyhydroxides, oxycarbonates, hydrooxycarbonates and any mixture thereof (ABSTRACT/SECTION 0046). Kweon et al disclose that the coating material may have amorphous or crystalline form (SECTIONS 0046, 0128, 0153/ CLAIM 5); and amorphous Al-hydroxide (SECTION 0128, 0150, 0152).

Art Unit: 1745

In particular, Kweon et al disclose the use of coating element from the group of Mg, Al, Co, K, Na, Ca, Si, Ti, V, Sn, Ge, Ga, B, As, Zr (SECTION 0047/CLAIM 4). In addition to that, Kweon et al disclose the content of the coating element of the coating material is preferably 0.001 to 2 wt % (SECTION 0047, 0077).

## On the matter of 2 and 11:

Kweon et al disclose the lithiated compound may be (SECTIONS 0049-0054):

[0049]. The core includes at least one lithian and preferably includes at least one lithian represented by the formulas 1 to 11.	
Li <sub>z</sub> Me, M.A.	a y
Li <sub>3</sub> Mü <sub>1</sub> , M',O <sub>2, A</sub> ,	(2)
Li <sub>s</sub> Mn <sub>1</sub> O <sub>G s</sub> A <sub>x</sub>	(3)
Li, Mo., NI, A.	(4)
Li,M.,M',A.	(5)
Li <sub>x</sub> MO <sub>2-x</sub> A <sub>2</sub> (b)	
ELSNI <sub>L-A</sub> CO <sub>V</sub> O <sub>S-A</sub> A <sub>S</sub>	3333 (7)
Li, Ni, , , , Co, M*, Aa	(8)
LiaNia yeaMraMaAcc	(v)
GaNi, , , Co, M°, O <sub>2</sub> , No	Co
Li <sub>2</sub> Ni <sub>1-3-2</sub> Mn <sub>2</sub> Mn <sub>2</sub> O <sub>2-662</sub>	(11)
[0050] where	
[0051] 0.95≦x≦1.1.0≦y≦0.5,0≦z≦0.5,0 ≤	£α≦2,
[00\$2] M is Ni or Cu,	
[0053] M' is at least one element selected fr consisting of Al, Ni, Co, Cr, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Sc, Nd, Pm, Sm, Eu, Gd, Tb, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, Yt Pa, U, Np, Pn, Am, Cm, Bk, Cf, Es, Fm, Md	Y, La, Ce, Pr, , Lu, Ac, Th,
[0054] M° is at least one element selected fr consisting of Al, Cr, Mn, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Sc, Y, I Pm, Sm, En, Gd, Tb, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, Yb, La U, Np, Pu, Am, Cm, Bk, Cf, Es, Fm, Md, No	a, Ce, Pr, Nd, i. Ac, Th, Pa,

## In reference to claim 5 and 13:

As to the method limitation, i.e. the additive compound being prepared by the specific drying and temperature treatment (heat treatment), it is noted that a method limitation incorporated into a product claim does not patentable distinguish the product because what is given patentably consideration is the product itself and not the manner in which the product was made. Therefore, the patentability of a product is independent of how it was made.

Consequently, the claims are anticipated.

5. Claims 1-2, 5, 10-11 and 13 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as being anticipated by Kweon et al 2003/0003352.

The applied reference has common inventors with the instant application. Based upon the earlier effective U.S. filing date of the reference, it constitutes prior art under 35 U.S.C. 102(e). This rejection under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) might be overcome either by a showing under 37 CFR 1.132 that any invention disclosed but not claimed in the reference was derived from the inventor of this application and is thus not the invention "by another," or by an appropriate showing under 37 CFR 1.131.

The present claims are drawn to a positive active material composition wherein the disclosed inventive concept comprises the specific additive compound.

## As to claims 1 and 10:

Kweon et al disclose a positive active material for a rechargeable battery including a positive active material layer and a surface treatment layer thereon (ABSTRACT/CLAIM 1); the core includes at least one lithiated compound and the surface treatment layer includes at least one coating material selected from the group consisting of coating element included-hydroxides, oxyhydroxides, oxycarbonates, hydrooxycarbonates and any mixture thereof (ABSTRACT/CLAIM 1). Kweon et al disclose that the coating material may have amorphous or crystalline form (SECTION 0037/CLAIM 8).

In particular, Kweon et al disclose the use of coating element from the group of Mg, Al, Co, K, Na, Ca, Si, Ti, V, Sn, Ge, Ga, B, As, Zr (CLAIM 3). In addition to that, Kweon et al disclose that the concentration of the coating element is at or between 0.1-20 wt% of the coating solution (SECTION 0035).

Art Unit: 1745

## On the matter of 2 and 11:

Kweon et al disclose the lithiated compound may be (CLAIM 2):

2. The positive electrode according to claim 1, wherein said positive active material comprises a lithiated compound selected from the group consisting of compounds represented by the formulas 1 to 13:

$\text{Li}_{\lambda}\text{Mn}_{1}_{\circ}\text{M}_{\lambda}\text{A}_{2}$	(1)
$li_xMn_{1,y}M_yO_{2,z}X_y$	(2)
$\operatorname{Li}_{\mathbf{x}}\operatorname{Mn}_{\mathbf{z}}\operatorname{O}_{4_{-\mathbf{x}}}\operatorname{X}_{\mathbf{z}}$	(3)
Li <sub>x</sub> Mn <sub>xy</sub> M <sub>y</sub> A <sub>4</sub>	(4)
Li <sub>x</sub> Co <sub>x</sub> , M <sub>y</sub> A <sub>y</sub>	(5)
$U_xC_{0_1,y}M_yO_{2,z}X_x$	(6)
$\text{Li}_{\mathbf{x}} \text{Ni}_{\mathbf{j}_{-\mathbf{y}}} \mathbf{M}_{\mathbf{z}} \mathbf{A}_{2}$	(7)
Li <sub>x</sub> Ni <sub>1.5</sub> M <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> ,X <sub>2</sub>	(8)
$\text{Li}_{x}\text{Ni}_{1-x}\text{Co}_{z}\text{O}_{2-x}\text{X}_{z}$	(9)
Li <sub>2</sub> Ni <sub>1-y-k</sub> Co <sub>y</sub> M <sub>2</sub> A <sub>a</sub>	(10)
$Li_xNi_{1-y,x}Co_yM_xO_{2-x}X_a$	(u)
Li <sub>x</sub> Ni <sub>1.v.*</sub> Mn <sub>v</sub> M <sub>x</sub> A <sub>x</sub>	(12)
Li <sub>x</sub> Ni <sub>1-v-z</sub> Mn <sub>x</sub> M <sub>2</sub> O <sub>2-x</sub> X <sub>2</sub>	(13)

#### wherein:

 $0.95 \le x \le 1.1$ :  $0 \le y \le 0.5$ ;  $0 \le z \le 0.5$ ;  $0 \le \alpha \le 2$ .

M is one element selected from the group consisting of Al, Ni, Co, Mn, Cr, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, and rare earth elements,

A is selected from the group consisting of O, F, S, and P, and

X is selected from the group consisting of F, S, and P.

## In reference to claim 5 and 13:

As to the method limitation, i.e. the additive compound being prepared by the specific drying and temperature treatment (heat treatment), it is noted that a method limitation incorporated into a product claim does not patentable distinguish the product because what is given patentably consideration is the product itself and not the manner in which the product was made. Therefore, the patentability of a product is independent of how it was made.

Hence, the claims are anticipated.

6. Claims 1-2, 5, 10-11 and 13 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as being anticipated by Kweon et al 6753111.

Page 7

The applied reference has common inventors with the instant application. Based upon the earlier effective U.S. filing date of the reference, it constitutes prior art under 35 U.S.C. 102(e). This rejection under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) might be overcome either by a showing under 37 CFR 1.132 that any invention disclosed but not claimed in the reference was derived from the inventor of this application and is thus not the invention "by another," or by an appropriate showing under 37 CFR 1.131.

The present claims are drawn to a positive active material composition wherein the disclosed inventive concept comprises the specific additive compound.

## As to claims 1 and 10:

Kweon et al disclose a positive active material for a rechargeable battery including a positive active material comprising a core and a surface treatment layer thereon (ABSTRACT/ CLAIM 1); the core includes at least one lithiated compound and the surface treatment layer includes at least one coating material selected from the group consisting of coating element included-hydroxides, oxyhydroxides, oxycarbonates, hydrooxycarbonates and any mixture thereof (ABSTRACT/CLAIM 1, 12, 15). Kweon et al disclose that the coating material have a crystalline form (COL 7, lines 21-35). Kweon et al disclose the specific coating material being Al-hydroxide (CLAIM 12).

In particular, Kweon et al disclose the use of coating element from the group of Mg, Al, Co, K, Na, Ca, Si, Ti, V, Ge, Ga, B, As, Zr (CLAIM 3). In addition to that, Kweon et al disclose

that the content of the coating element is 0.001-1 wt% based on the weight of the positive active material (CLAIM 5).

## On the matter of 2 and 11:

Kweon et al disclose the lithiated compound may be (CLAIM 2):

```
2. The positive active material according to claim 1,
 wherein the lithiated compound is at least one compound
 selected from the group consisting of compounds repre-
 sented by the formulas I to 11:
          Li,Ma, M',A
                                                                          (1)
          Li, Ma, M', O. X.
                                                                          (2).
          Li Ma O A
                                                                          (3)
          Li Mn., M', A4
                                                                          (4).
          Li,M, M',A,
                                                                          (5)
          LCMO, A.
                                                                          (6)
          Li, Ni, Co,O, A.
                                                                          (7)
          Li,Ni, ,, Co,M.A.
                                                                          (8)
          Li,Ni<sub>1</sub> ,...Co,M',O<sub>2</sub> ...X<sub>8</sub>
                                                                          (9)
          Li, Nic., Ma, M.A.
                                                                         (10)
          LizNizza Mo, M', Oz .. Xo
                                                                         (ti)
    wherein:
    0.95 \le x \le 1.1, 0 \le y \le 0.5, 0 \le z \le 0.5, 0, \alpha \le 2
    M is Ni or Co.
    M' is at least one element selected from the group
consisting of Al, Ni, Co, Cr, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Se, Y, La,
Ce, Pr, Nd, Pm, Sm, Eu, Gd, Tb, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, Yb,
       Lu, Ac, Th, and Pa,
     M" is at least one element selected from the group
       consisting of Al, Cr, Mn, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Sc, Y, La, Ce, Pr, Nd, Pm, Sm, Eu, Gd, Tb, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, Yb, Lu.
        Ac, Th, and Pa,
     A is selected from the group consisting of O, P, S and P,
       and
    X is selected from the group consisting of F, S and P.
```

#### In reference to claim 5 and 13:

As to the method limitation, i.e. the additive compound being prepared by the specific drying and temperature treatment (heat treatment), it is noted that a method limitation incorporated into a product claim does not patentable distinguish the product because what is given patentably consideration is the product itself and not the manner in which the product was made. Therefore, the patentability of a product is independent of how it was made.

As a result, the claims are anticipated.

7. Claims 1-2, 5, 10-11 and 13 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as being anticipated by Kweon et al 6797435.

The applied reference has common inventors with the instant application. Based upon the earlier effective U.S. filing date of the reference, it constitutes prior art under 35 U.S.C. 102(e). This rejection under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) might be overcome either by a showing under 37 CFR 1.132 that any invention disclosed but not claimed in the reference was derived from the inventor of this application and is thus not the invention "by another," or by an appropriate showing under 37 CFR 1.131.

The present claims are drawn to a positive active material composition wherein the disclosed inventive concept comprises the specific additive compound.

## As to claims 1 and 10:

Kweon et al disclose a positive active material for a rechargeable battery including a positive active material comprising a core and a surface treatment layer thereon (ABSTRACT/CLAIM 1); the core includes at least one lithiated compound and the surface treatment layer includes at least one coating material selected from the group consisting of coating element included-hydroxides, oxyhydroxides, oxycarbonates, hydrooxycarbonates and any mixture thereof (ABSTRACT/CLAIM 1). Kweon et al disclose that the coating material may have an amorphous or crystalline form (COL 7, lines 13-18).

In particular, Kweon et al disclose the use of coating element from the group of Mg, Al, Co, K, Na, Ca, Si, Ti, V, Ge, Ga, B, As, Zr (ABSTRACT/CLAIM 1). In addition to that, Kweon et al disclose that the content of the coating element is 0.1-5 wt% based on the weight of the positive active material (COL 5, lines 50-59).

Art Unit: 1745

## On the matter of 2 and 11:

Kweon et al disclose the lithiated compound may be (CLAIM 2):

2. The positive active material according to claim 1, wherein:

the lithiated compound is selected from the group consisting of compounds represented by the formulas 1 to 13:

30

	Li <sub>x</sub> Ma <sub>j-y</sub> M <sub>y</sub> A <sub>y</sub>	(1)
	$L_{i_x}M_{n_1}$ , $M_{v}O_{2-2}X_{s}$	(2)
	$\operatorname{Li}_{\mathbf{x}}\operatorname{Mn}_{2}\operatorname{O}_{\mathbf{x},\mathbf{z}}\operatorname{X}_{\mathbf{z}}$	(3)
	Li <sub>2</sub> Ma <sub>2-2</sub> M <sub>4</sub> A <sub>4</sub>	(4)
	Li <sub>w</sub> Co <sub>1-y</sub> M <sub>y</sub> A-	(5)
	Li <sub>x</sub> Co <sub>1-y</sub> M <sub>y</sub> O <sub>2-x</sub> X <sub>y</sub>	(6)
	Li <sub>x</sub> Ni <sub>t</sub> M <sub>x</sub> A <sub>3</sub>	(7)
	$L_xN_{1-y}M_yO_{2-x}X_y$	(8)
	Li <sub>x</sub> Ni <sub>x-y</sub> Co <sub>y</sub> O <sub>y-y</sub> X <sub>z</sub>	(9)
9::::::::::::	LixNing, Co, M, A,	(10)
	Li <sub>x</sub> Ni <sub>1</sub> , <sub>2</sub> Co <sub>6</sub> M <sub>2</sub> O <sub>2</sub> <sub>α</sub> X <sub>α</sub>	(11)
	Li <sub>x</sub> Ni <sub>1</sub> , <sub>2</sub> Mn <sub>6</sub> M <sub>2</sub> A <sub>6</sub>	(12)
	Li <sub>x</sub> N <sub>1</sub> , Mn <sub>x</sub> M <sub>2</sub> O <sub>1, a</sub> X <sub>a</sub>	(13),

 $0.95 \le x \le 1.1, 0 \le y \le 0.5, 0 \le z \le 0.5, 0 \le \alpha \le 2,$ 

M is one selected from the group consisting of Al, Ni, Co, Mn, Cr, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, or rare earth elements,

A is selected from the group consisting of O, F, S and P, and

and

X is selected from the group consisting of F, S and P.

# In reference to claim 5 and 13:

As to the method limitation, i.e. the additive compound being prepared by the specific drying and temperature treatment (heat treatment), it is noted that a method limitation incorporated into a product claim does not patentable distinguish the product because what is given patentably consideration is the product itself and not the manner in which the product was made. Therefore, the patentability of a product is independent of how it was made.

For this reason, the claims are anticipated.

Art Unit: 1745

# Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

- 8. The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:
  - (a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negatived by the manner in which the invention was made.
- 9. This application currently names joint inventors. In considering patentability of the claims under 35 U.S.C. 103(a), the examiner presumes that the subject matter of the various claims was commonly owned at the time any inventions covered therein were made absent any evidence to the contrary. Applicant is advised of the obligation under 37 CFR 1.56 to point out the inventor and invention dates of each claim that was not commonly owned at the time a later invention was made in order for the examiner to consider the applicability of 35 U.S.C. 103(c) and potential 35 U.S.C. 102(e), (f) or (g) prior art under 35 U.S.C. 103(a).
- 10. Claims 1-2, 5, 10-11 and 13 and 38-39 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Amatucci et al 5705291 in view of the Japanese publication JP 09-171813 (hereinafter referred to as "the JP'813 publication").

The present claims are drawn to a positive active material composition wherein the disclosed inventive concept comprises the specific additive compound.

#### In reference to claims 1 and 10:

Amatucci et al disclose a positive electrode comprising a lithiated composition particulate comprising the positive electrode which have been coated with a passivating layer of a composition comprising a borate, lithiated borate, aluminate, lithiated aluminate, silicate, lithiated silicate or mixture thereof (ABSTRACT). It is also disclosed that the lithiated

Page 11

Art Unit: 1745

intercalation compound is coated with coating compositions comprising boron oxide, boric acid, <a href="https://lithium.hydroxide">https://lithium.hydroxide</a>, aluminum oxide, lithium aluminate, lithium metaborate, silicon dioxide, lithium silicate or mixtures thereof (CLAIMS 1 and 6/ COL 2, lines 5-25). It is noted that such coating compositions represent additive compounds, that is, compounds added to, included to or incorporated into the positive active material.

It is disclosed that such additive compound can be added in an amount ranging from 0.4 to 1.0 % by weight (EXAMPLES 1-3). In particular, *EXAMPLE 3* shows the addition of 0.4 % of the borate powder (EXAMPLE 3) (—emphasis added).

- 6. A rechargeable battery cell comprising a negative electrode, a positive electrode, and an intermediate nonaque ous electrolyte characterized in that said positive electrode comprises a particulate lithium intercalation compound the particles of which are coated with a passivating layer comprising an annealed coating composition comprising so boron oxide, boric acid, lithium hydroxide, aluminum oxide, lithium aluminate, lithium metaborate, silicon dioxide, lithium silicate, or mixtures thereof.
- These objects, among others, have been achieved in the present invention by means of a novel lithium intercalation cell in which the surfaces of aggregate lithiated intercalation composition particulates comprising the positive cell electrode have been passivated by coating or encapsulation in a layer of a composition comprising a borate, lithiated borate, aluminate, lithiated aluminate, sillicate, or lithiated silicate. Such a coating not only reduces the surface area, and thus the degree of activity, of the potentially catalytic particulate aggregates, but also provides a barrier layer which, while limiting contact between the electrolyte and the positive electrode particulates, does not seriously deter the passage of Li\* ions.
- In a preferred embodiment of the present invention, the surfaces of these particulates are coated with a layer of a composition comprising boron oxide, boric acid, lithium hydroxide, aluminum oxide, lithium aluminate, lithium metaborate, silicon dioxide, lithium silicate, or mixtures thereof. In another embodiment of the present invention, the

It is disclosed that the coating composition has either a glassy or crystalline form (COL 4, lines 13-17); in particular, the borate is amorphous (EXAMPLE 1).

#### In reference to claims 2 and 11:

Amatucci et al teach the use of LiCoO<sub>2</sub>, LiNiO<sub>2</sub> and Li<sub>1+x</sub>Mn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> (COL 1, line 38-42). **EXAMPLES 1-3** illustrates the specific use of LiMn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> (EXAMPLES 1-3).

Page 13

Art Unit: 1745

## In reference to claim and 10:

Amatucci et al shows with *sufficient specificity* the use of H<sub>3</sub>BO<sub>3</sub> and/or B<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> compounds among others. Amatucci et al also disclose the use of composition comprising a borate, lithiated borate, aluminate, lithiated aluminate, silicate, lithiated silicate or mixture thereof (ABSTRACT). It is also disclosed that the lithiated intercalation compound is coated with coating compositions comprising boron oxide, boric acid, lithium hydroxide, aluminum oxide, lithium aluminate, lithium metaborate, silicon dioxide, lithium silicate or mixtures thereof (CLAIMS 1 and 6/ COL 2, lines 5-25).

In this respect, it is noted that EXAMPLE 3 shows the use of  $B_2O_3$  and  $LiOH-H_2O$  to obtain a fine lithiated powder (EXAMPLE 3 or COL 5, lines 25-45). Thus, it is contended that a secondary product of such mixture combination of  $B_2O_3$  and  $LiOH-H_2O$  can be a hydroxide of boron.

## In reference to claims 5 and 13:

As to the method limitation, i.e. the additive compound being prepared by the specific drying and temperature treatment (heat treatment), it is noted that a method limitation incorporated into a product claim does not patentable distinguish the product because what is given patentably consideration is the product itself and not the manner in which the product was made. Therefore, the patentability of a product is independent of how it was made.

Moreover, Amatucci et al disclose the process of annealing the material at a temperature in the excess of about 400 °C, preferably in the range of about 500-800 °C (COL 2, lines 19-29).

Hence, it is contended that at these temperatures, the drying of liquid necessarily occurs unless

the liquid has an evaporation point higher than 800 °C. Nevertheless, the claim language is silent as to the specific chemical composition of the liquid subjected to the drying step.

As to claim 38:

It is disclosed that positive electrode composition is associated with a current collector member all together (COL 2, lines 60-67).

Amatucci et al'291 disclose a coated positive electrode according to the foregoing aspects. However, the preceding prior art fails to expressly disclose the specific thermal absorbent material; the additive compound not including lithium and not coating with the additive compound.

## With respect to claims 1, 3, 10 and 36-37:

The JP'813 publication discloses a positive electrode active material including an inorganic material (ABSTRACT). In particular, the JP'813 publication discloses an active material comprising a lithiated compound and aluminum hydroxide (SECTION 0019-0021). It is noted that aluminum hydroxide is a thermal absorbent element.

#### As to claims 2, 11:

The JP'813 publication teaches the use of lithium multiple oxides such as LiCoO2, LiNiO2, LixNiyCo1-yO2 and LiMn2O4 (SECTION 0024).

## Concerning claims 38-39:

The JP'813 publication teaches the mixing of the lithiated compound and the aluminum hydroxide upon formation thereof and having deposited the composite material on the electrode support (SECTION 0020) including forming a composite slurry which is applied to a foil (SECTIONS 0035-0038).

In view of the above, it would have been obvious to one skilled in the art at the time the invention was made to use the specific additive compound not including lithium and not coating with the additive compound of the JP'813 publication in the positive active material of Amatucci et al as the JP'813 publication teaches that such additive compound provides a positive active material network structure with improved load and capacity characteristics; and excellent charging/discharging cycle-ability.

## **Double Patenting**

The nonstatutory double patenting rejection is based on a judicially created doctrine grounded in public policy (a policy reflected in the statute) so as to prevent the unjustified or improper timewise extension of the "right to exclude" granted by a patent and to prevent possible harassment by multiple assignees. See *In re Goodman*, 11 F.3d 1046, 29 USPQ2d 2010 (Fed. Cir. 1993); *In re Longi*, 759 F.2d 887, 225 USPQ 645 (Fed. Cir. 1985); *In re Van Ornum*, 686 F.2d 937, 214 USPQ 761 (CCPA 1982); *In re Vogel*, 422 F.2d 438, 164 USPQ 619 (CCPA 1970); and, *In re Thorington*, 418 F.2d 528, 163 USPQ 644 (CCPA 1969).

A timely filed terminal disclaimer in compliance with 37 CFR 1.321(c) may be used to overcome an actual or provisional rejection based on a nonstatutory double patenting ground provided the conflicting application or patent is shown to be commonly owned with this application. See 37 CFR 1.130(b).

Effective January 1, 1994, a registered attorney or agent of record may sign a terminal disclaimer. A terminal disclaimer signed by the assignee must fully comply with 37 CFR 3.73(b).

12. Claims 1-2, 5, 10-11 and 13 are rejected under the judicially created doctrine of obviousness-type double patenting as being unpatentable over claims 1-3, 11 and 15 of U.S.

Art Unit: 1745

Patent No. 6797435 in view of Amatucci et al 5705291. Although the conflicting claims are not identical, they are not patentably distinct from each other because of the following reasons:

The '435 patent claims the following (CLAIMS 1-3, 11 and 15):

I. A positive active material for a rechargeable lithium battery comprising: a core comprising a lithlated compound; and at least two surface-treatment layers formed on said core, each of said surface-treatment layers comprising at least one compound selected from the group consisting. of a coating-element-included hydroxide, a coatingelement-included oxyhydroxide, a coating-element-20 included oxycarbonate, and a coating-element-included hydroxycarbonate, wherein the coating element is selected from the group consisting of Al, Si, Ti, Sn, V, Ge, Ga, B, and As. 2. The positive active material according to claim 1, wherein: the lithiated compound is selected from the group consisting of compounds represented by the formulas I to

			<u></u>	 			
	Bi-Mn. M.A			735			
	Li <sub>x</sub> Mn <sub>1</sub> , M <sub>2</sub>	) X		(2)	19.00		
	Li, Mn.O.			(3)∷			
35	Li.MnM.	<b>4</b>		(4)	:::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::		
	Ligen, MA			(5)		1.1.23	H:::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::
				(6)		ddi.b.	
	E <sub>x</sub> N <sub>1</sub> , M,A			$\zeta^{\gamma}$			
	JJ,Ni,,M,O	×.		(3)			
	LixNi, Coc	3.4		(9)			
40	EigNij v gCo	M 12		13.03			
	Jan. Ma	MA	·	(12)			
	Light Mn	.M.O2		1135			
		prive runny	•				

- 45 0.95≦x≦1.1, 0≦y≦0.5, 0≦z≦0.5, 0≦α≦2,
  - M is one selected from the group consisting of Al, Ni, Co, Mn, Cr, Fe, Mg, Si, V, or rare earth elements,
  - A is selected from the group consisting of O, F, S and P, and
  - X is selected from the group consisting of F, S and P.
- 3. The positive active material according to claim 1, wherein said at least two surface-treatment layers comprise at least two coating elements selected from the group 55 consisting of Al, Si, Ti, Sn, V, Ge, Ga, B, and As.

# 11. A positive active material for a rechargeable lithium battery comprising:

- a core comprising a lithiated compound;
- a first surface-treatment layer formed on said core, said 60 first surface-treatment layer comprising at least one compound selected from the group consisting of an Al-included hydroxide, an Al-included oxycarbonate, and an Al-included hydroxycarbonate, and
- a second surface-treatment layer formed on said first surface-treatment layer, said second surface-treatment

35

#### 14

layer comprising at least one compound selected from the group consisting of an Si-included hydroxide, an Si-included oxyhydroxide, an Si-included oxycarbonate, and an Si-included hydroxycarbonate.

- 15. A positive active material for a rechargeable lithium 30 battery, comprising:
  - a core comprising a lithium-cobalt based compound;
  - a first surface-treatment layer formed on said core, said first surface-treatment layer comprising at least one compound selected from the group consisting of an Si-included hydroxide, an Si-included oxyhydroxide, an Si-included oxycarbonate, and an Si-included hydroxycarbonate; and
  - a second surface-treatment layer formed on said first surface-treatment layer, said second surface-treatment layer comprising at least one compound selected from the group consisting of an Al-included hydroxide, an Al-included oxyhydroxide, an Al-included oxycarbonate, and an Al-included hydroxycarbonate.

In this case, the application claims are broader or more generic than the patent claims, thus, the application claims are anticipated by the patent claims. Accordingly, a broad limitation/range is anticipated by a narrow limitation/range which lies within the broad limitation. *In re Goodman*.

The '435 patent claims a positive active material as described above. However, the '435 patent does not expressly claim the specific weight percent of the additive compound.

Amatucci et al disclose a positive electrode comprising a lithiated composition particulate comprising the positive electrode which have been coated with a passivating layer of a composition comprising an additive compound including a hydroxide (CLAIMS 1 and 6/ COL 2, lines 5-25). It is noted that such coating compositions represent additive compounds, that is, compounds added to, included to or incorporated into the positive active material. It is disclosed that such additive compound can be added in an amount ranging from 0.4 to 1.0 % by weight

Application/Control Number: 10/092,300 Page 18

Art Unit: 1745

(EXAMPLES 1-3). In particular, *EXAMPLE 3* shows the addition of 0.4 % of the borate powder (EXAMPLE 3) (←*emphasis added*).

In spite of these disclosures, it would have been obvious to one skilled in the art at the time the invention was made to use the specific weight percent of the additive compound of Amatucci et al in the positive active material of the '435 patent as the Amatucci et al disclose that positive active materials having such additive weight percent exhibit improved cycle capacity and electrochemical performance. Furthermore, Amatucci et al directly teach the use of additive compound within the claimed range; and with sufficient specificity.

13. Claims 1-2, 5, 10-11 and 13 are rejected under the judicially created doctrine of obviousness-type double patenting as being unpatentable over claims 1-5 and 12-17 of U.S. Patent No. 6753111. Although the conflicting claims are not identical, they are not patentably distinct from each other because of the following reasons:

The '111 patent claims the following (CLAIMS 1-5 and 12-17):

- 1. A positive active material for a rechargeable lithium battery comprising:
  - a core comprising a lithiated compound, the lithiated compound comprising a secondary particle having an  $^5$  average size larger than or equal to  $1~\mu m$  and smaller than  $10~\mu m$  in diameter, the secondary particle being formed of an agglomeration of small primary particles of an average size of 1 to  $3~\mu m$  in diameter; and
  - a surface-treatment layer on the core, the surfacetreatment layer comprising a coating-element-included oxide or a coating-element-included hydroxide, oxyhydroxide, oxycarbonate, hydroxycarbonate or a mixture thereof.

Art Unit: 1745

where	The positive active material according to a in the lithiated compound is at least one could from the group consisting of compound by the formulas 1 to 11:	mpound:	<b>195</b>
	Li <sub>2</sub> Ma <sub>2,3</sub> M',A <sub>2</sub>	(9)	<b>.::(</b> (·
	U_Mu_M_O_XX	(2)	
	Li,Ma <sub>2</sub> O, A	(3)	
	Li <sub>s</sub> Mn <sub>2,3</sub> M <sub>3</sub> A <sub>4</sub>	(4)	25
	TIM, M'A.		
		(5)	
	LL,MO.,A,	(6)	
	Li <sub>n</sub> Ni <sub>1</sub> , <sub>2</sub> Co <sub>2</sub> O <sub>2</sub> , <sub>2</sub> A <sub>2</sub>	(7)	3:1
	LLNI <sub>-pe</sub> Co <sub>p</sub> M°,A <sub>n</sub>	(3)	
	Li, Ni <sub>ner</sub> , Co <sub>s</sub> M' <sub>2</sub> O <sub>2+s</sub> X <sub>o</sub> ,	(%)	
	Li,Ni <sub>Ly</sub> ,Mo,M',A <sub>n</sub>	(10)	3.5
	Li,Ni <sub>1+1</sub> ,Me,M',O <sub>3-2</sub> X.	(11)	
M i	5≦x≦1.1.0≦y≦0.5,0≦z≦0.5,0,α≦2, s Ni or Co, is at least one element selected from the consisting of Al, Ni, Co, Cr, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Sc λc, Pr, Nd, Pm, Sm, Eu, Gd, Th, Dy, Ho, Er, u, Ac, Th, and Pa,	Y 1 3	45
C I A	is at least one element selected from the consisting of Al, Cr, Mn, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Sc, Y, r, Nd, Pm, Sm, Eu, Gd, Tb, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, sc, Th, and Pa, selected from the group consisting of O, F, and	La, Ce, Yb, Lu,	\$0
3. where consist and Z 4. where treater positiv 5.	s selected from the group consisting of F. S a The positive active material according to in the coating element is selected from the sing of Mg. Al, Co, K, Na, Ca, Si, Ti, V, Ge, Cr.  The positive active material according to in the content of the coating element of the content sent layer is 2×10 <sup>-2</sup> to 1 wt % based on the vice active material.  The positive active material according to in the content of the coating element of the	claim 1 he group ia, B, As claim 1 surface weight of claim 4	) \$\$ [ 60

In this case, the application claims are broader or more generic than the patent claims, thus, the application claims are anticipated by the patent claims. Accordingly, a broad limitation/range is anticipated by a narrow limitation/range which lies within the broad limitation. In re Goodman. It is also noted that the specific weight percent of the additive

compound is an obvious variation of the claimed invention in the '111 patent claims as claims 4-5 thereof specifically claims the particular weight percent.

14. Claims 1-2, 5, 10-11 and 13 are provisionally rejected under the judicially created doctrine of obviousness-type double patenting as being unpatentable over claims 1-15, 28-30, 32-35 of copending Application No. 10/189384 (US Patent Application Publication 2003/0054250). Although the conflicting claims are not identical, they are not patentably distinct from each other because of the following reasons:

The copending application'384 claims the following (claims 1-15, 28-30, 32-35):

- 1. An active material for a battery, comprising:
- a material that undergoes reversible electrochemical oxidation-reduction reactions and having a surface;
- a surface treatment layer on the surface and comprising a conductive agent and at least one coating-elementcontaining compound selected from the group consisting of a coating-element-containing hydroxide, a coating-element-containing oxyhydroxide, element-containing oxycarbonate, a coating-elementcontaining hydroxycarbonate, and a mixture thereof.
- 2. The active material of claim 1, wherein said material is selected from the group consisting of a metal, a lithiumcontaining alloy, a compound that reversibly forms a lithium-containing compound by a reaction with lithium ions, a material that reversibly intercalates/deintercalates lithium ions and a lithiated intercalation compound.

<u> </u>		**********		
	77.78 C			
111111111111 (111111111111)		54.0	1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.1.	tatatata 🤇 Mitatat in Latatatatatata
+1 1+1+1+1+1+1+1+1+1+1+1+1+	Cianta, "Vi	$1, \Omega_{2,N_{p}}$	ajujuju jurujuru larururur.	1000 ( <b>2)</b>
elecel lelecelelelece	Li <sub>n</sub> Mn <sub>1</sub> M Li <sub>n</sub> Mn <sub>2</sub> O <sub>4</sub> Li <sub>n</sub> Mn <sub>2</sub> O <sub>4</sub> .			
nanananananan Jiraharan	Li <sub>w</sub> Mn <sub>2</sub> <sub>w</sub> M	A.	· ·.·	
	Li, Co,M			delet <b>i≳k</b> ira taranaranaran
	7. (20)			
ananananan arang barang ba	LigCoggyMt	المناهق لاشوارا		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
*1*1*1*1*1*1*1*1*1*1*1*		A 2		talah (2) alabah dalam dalam
	1.1, N. G., A1,	Ozzak		<b>(8)</b>
*.*.*.*.*.*.*.*.*.*.*.*	LLINILLCO	$\mathbf{co} \cdot \mathbf{x} \cdot \mathbf{x} \cdot \cdots$	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	arana <b>(9)</b> arang mengelebek

<sup>3.</sup> The active material of claim 2, wherein said material comprises the lithiated intercalation compound that is selected from the group consisting of a lithium-containing initial oxide; a lithium-containing chalcogenide compound; and a carbon-based material of claim 2, wherein said material comprises the lithiated intercalation compound that is at least one selected from the group consisting of a lithium compound with the following formulas (1) to (13):

		-contin	ued			
	Li_Ni;Co Li_Ni;Co Li_Ni;Ma Li_Ni;Ma	M <sub>z</sub> A <sub>u</sub> M <sub>z</sub> O <sub>2-u</sub> X <sub>u</sub> M <sub>z</sub> A <sub>u</sub>		() ()	0) 1) 2)	
	IA, NI, , , , Ma	M,O <sub>2</sub> «X <sub>e</sub>		:::::: <b>(</b> ?	3)	

#### wherein

0.955x<0.1: 05y50.5: 05: 50.5: 05a52;

M is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Al, Ni, Co, Mn, Cr, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, and rare carth elements;

A is at least one element selected from the group consisting of O. F. S, and P; and

X is at least one element selected from the group consisting of P, S, and P

The active material of claim 1, wherein the coating element is soluble in an organic solvent or water.

6. The active material of claim 5, wherein the coating element is at least one selected from the group consisting of an alkali metal, an alkaline earth metal, a group 13 element of the Periodic Table, a group 14 element of the Periodic Table, and a transition metal.

7. The active material of claim 6, wherein the coating element is at least one selected from the group consisting of Mg, Al, Co, K, Na, Ca, Si, Ti, B, As, Zr, Su, V, Ge, Ga, and a combination thereof.

8. The active material of claim 1, wherein the coatingelement-containing compound has either an amorphous or a crystalline phase.

9. The active material of claim 1, wherein a thickness of said surface-treatment layer is 1 to 300 nm.

10. The active material of claim 9, wherein a thickness of said surface-treatment layer is 1 to 100 nm.

11. The active material of claim 1, wherein an amount of the coating element is  $2 \times 10^{-5}$  to 2% by weight of the active material.

- 12. The active material of claim 11, wherein the amount of the coating element is 0.001 to 2% by weight of the active material.
- 13. The active material of claim 1, wherein the conductive agent is at least one material selected from the group consisting of a carbon-based conductive agent, a graphite-based conductive agent, a metal-based conductive agent, and a metallic-compound-based conductive agent.
- 14. The active material of claim 1, wherein an amount of the conductive agent is 0.5 to 10% by weight of the active material.
- 15. The active material of claim 14, wherein the amount of the conductive agent is 1 to 5% by weight of the active material.

- 28. An active material for a battery comprising:
- a material that has a surface and that undergoes reversible electrochemical oxidation-reduction reactions; and
- a surface treatment layer on the surface, the layer comprising a conductive agent and an Al-containing compound selected from the group consisting of an Alcontaining hydroxide, an Al-containing oxyhydroxide, an Al-containing oxycarbonate, an Al-containing hydroxycarbonate, and a mixture thereof.
- 29. An active material for a battery comprising:
- a material that has a surface and that undergoes reversible electrochemical exidation-reduction reactions; and
- a surface treatment layer on the surface, the layer comprising a conductive agent and a B-containing compound selected from the group consisting of a B-containing hydroxide, a B-containing oxyhydroxide, a B-containing oxycarbonate, a B-containing hydroxycarbonate, and a mixture thereof.
- 30. An active material for a battery, comprising:
- a material that has a surface and that undergoes reversible electrochemical oxidation-reduction reactions; and
- a surface treatment layer coated on the surface, wherein said coated material is prepared by a method comprising:
- adding a conductive agent and a coating-element source to a solvent selected from the group consisting of water, organic solvent, and a mixture thereof to prepare a coating liquid;
- adding said material to the coating liquid to coat said material; and
- drying the coated material to form the surface-treatment layer comprising the conductive agent and at least one coating-element-containing compound selected from the group consisting of a coating-element-containing hydroxide, a coating-element-containing oxyhydroxide, a coating-element-containing oxyearbonate, a coating-element-containing hydroxycarbonate, and a mixture thereof
- 32. An electrode for use in a battery, comprising:
- a current collector; and
- an active material coated with a layer, the layer comprising a conductive agent and at least one compound selected from the group consisting of a coating-element-containing bydroxide, a coating-element-containing oxyhydroxide, a coating-element-containing oxycarbonate, a coating-element-containing bydroxycarbonate, and a mixture thereof,
  - wherein said active material is coated on said current collector.
- 33. A battery comprising:
- a first electrode comprising a current collector and a coated active material, the coated active material comprising a layer including a conductive agent and at least one compound selected from the group consisting of a coating-element-containing hydroxide, a coating-element-containing oxyhydroxide, a coating-element-containing oxyhydroxide, a coating-element-containing hydroxycarbonate, and a mixture thereof;
- an electrolyte; and
- a counter electrode spaced apart from said first electrode to perform reversible oxidation-reduction reactions with said first electrode through said electrolyte.
- 34. The active material of claim 1, wherein an average particle size of said material is 1 to 50 µm.
- 35. The active material of claim 34, wherein the average particle size is 5 to 20  $\mu m$ .

Application/Control Number: 10/092,300 Page 23

Art Unit: 1745

In this case, the application claims are broader or more generic than the copending application'384 claims, thus, the application claims are anticipated by the copending application'384 claims. Accordingly, a broad limitation/range is anticipated by a narrow limitation/range which lies within the broad limitation. In re Goodman. It is also noted that the specific weight percent of the additive compound is an obvious variation of the claimed invention in the copending application'384 as claims 11-12 and 14-15 thereof specifically claims the particular weight percent.

This is a <u>provisional</u> obviousness-type double patenting rejection because the conflicting claims have not in fact been patented.

15. Claims 1-2, 5, 10-11 and 13 are provisionally rejected under the judicially created doctrine of obviousness-type double patenting as being unpatentable over claims 1-5 and 23-28 of copending Application No. 10/072923 (US Patent Application Publication 2003/0003352) in view of Amatucci et al 5705291. Although the conflicting claims are not identical, they are not patentably distinct from each other because of the following reasons:

The copending application'923 claims the following (CLAIMS 1-5 and 23-28):

- a current collector;
- a positive active material layer coated on said current collector, said positive active material layer comprising a positive active material; and
- a surface-treatment layer on said positive active material layer, said surface treatment layer comprising a compound selected from the group consisting of a coating-element-included hydroxide, a coating-element-included oxyhydroxide, a coating-element-included oxycarbonale, a coating-element-included hydroxycarbonate, and a mixture thereof.
- 2. The positive electrode according to claim 1, wherein said positive active material comprises a lithiated compound selected from the group consisting of compounds represented by the formulas 1 to 13:

A positive electrode for a rechargeable lithium battery, comprising:

									÷	:			٠			Ė		:		Ċ		ं			ं				Ċ			: :			:		:	÷	ं				ं
							1			Ņ	11		٨	٤,	1	٠		:													ं	3	3				:		ं			:	ं
					: ::										X	•	•	×	٠.		Š			ं								. {	3) 3:		3	ं	ું						
																														Ė		Ç	4)										
				Ċ			- 1		`	¢	Ġ		M	Ç	O		_	Ċ,		:				:: ::								ì	6)										
				ं			1		×	Ç,	į.	,	vi	, (	Š			ુ		÷				::								(	7) 8)										
				: ::										•		į	,	Š				÷	ं									Ä	9 3										
	ं							٠.		ij	i.	v	ر,	٠,	٠,	۸		ö		١	ζ,											ă	ij										
							1			Č,	1.	•	,	v	o.	۸	۸,	c		٠	Ċ,									ं		(I	3			Ċ						÷	
٠.٠.	-	 	•	4	٠.	_		_	_		_				٠.		٠.			Ċ.			٠.,	٠.	٠, ٠	٠.	· · ·	•	Ċ.	٠.,		٠.٠	٠.	٠.:		. <u></u> .	٠.		<u></u>	٠,٠	٠.		٠.

#### wherein:

0.955×51.1; 05y50.5; 05×50.5; 05a52.

M is one element selected from the group consisting of Al, Ni. Co. Mn. Cr. Fe, Mg, Sr, V, and rare earth elements,

A is selected from the group consisting of O, F, S, and P, and

X is selected from the group consisting of F, S, and P.

- 3. The positive electrode according to claim 1, wherein said surface-treatment layer comprises a coating-element selected from the group consisting of Mg, Al, Co, k, Na, Ca, Si, Ti, Sa, V, Ge, Ga, B, As, and Zi.
- 4. The positive electrode according to claim 1, wherein said surface-treatment layer is formed by coating the positive active material layer with a coating liquid.
- 5. The positive electrode according to claim 4, wherein the coating process includes one of a dipping method and a vacuum impregnation method.
- 23. A positive electrode for a rechargeable lithium battery, comprising:
  - a current collector;
  - a positive active material layer coated on said current collector, said positive active material layer comprising a positive active material selected from the group consisting of lithium-cobalt chalcogenide, lithiummanganese chalcogenide, lithium-nickel chalcogenide and lithium-nickel-manganese chalcogenide; and
  - a surface-treatment layer on said positive active material layer, said surface treatment layer comprising a com-

pound selected from the group consisting of a coatingelement-included hydroxide, a coating-element-included oxyhydroxide, a coating-element-included oxycarbonate, a coating-element-included hydroxycarbonate, and a mixture thereof,

wherein the coating-element is one of Al and B.

24. A positive electrode for a rechargeable lithium battery, comprising:

- a current collector;
- a positive active material layer coated on said current collector, said positive active material layer comprising a LiCoO<sub>2</sub> positive active material; and
- a surface-treatment layer disposed on said positive active material layer, said surface treatment layer comprising a compound selected from the group consisting of a coating-element-included hydroxide, a coating-element-included oxyhydroxide, a coating-element-included oxycarbonate, a coating-element-included hydroxycarbonate, and a mixture thereof.

wherein the coating element is one of Al and B.

Page 25

Art Unit: 1745

25. A lithium battery comprising:

- a first electrode comprising a layer of a lithiated compound coated with a surface treatment layer, the surface treatment layer comprising one of a coating-elementincluded hydroxide, a coating-element-included oxyhydroxide; a coating-element-included oxycating-element-included hydroxy-carbonate, and a mixture thereof;
- a second electrode comprising a material to reversibly interculate lithium ions; and
- a separator and an electrolyte disposed between said first and second electrodes.
- 26. The lithium battery of claim 25, wherein the coating element comprises one of Mg, Al, Co, K, Na, Ca, Si, Ti, V, Sn, Go, B, As, and Zr.
- 27. The lithium battery of claim 25, wherein the surface treatment layer has a thickness of at or between 1 and 100 nm.
- 28. The lithium battery of claim 25, wherein said first electrode is prepared in accordance with a method comprising:
  - freating a current collector, which is coated with a layer of a positive active material, with a coating liquid, the coating liquid comprising one of a coating element and a coating-element-included compound; and
  - drying the treated current collector to form the surface treatment layer comprising one of the coating-element-included hydroxide, the coating-element-included oxycarbonate, the coating-element-included oxycarbonate, and a mixture thereof

In this case, the application claims are broader or more generic than the copending application'923 claims, thus, the application claims are anticipated by the copending application'923 claims. Accordingly, a broad limitation/range is anticipated by a narrow limitation/range which lies within the broad limitation. *In re Goodman*.

The copending application'923 claims a positive active material as described above.

However, the copending application'923 does not expressly claim the specific weight percent of the additive compound.

Amatucci et al disclose a positive electrode comprising a lithiated composition particulate comprising the positive electrode which have been coated with a passivating layer of a composition comprising an additive compound including a hydroxide (CLAIMS 1 and 6/ COL 2, lines 5-25). It is noted that such coating compositions represent additive compounds, that is,

Application/Control Number: 10/092,300 Page 26

Art Unit: 1745

compounds added to, included to or incorporated into the positive active material. It is disclosed that such additive compound can be added in an amount ranging from 0.4 to 1.0 % by weight (EXAMPLES 1-3). In particular, **EXAMPLE 3** shows the addition of 0.4 % of the borate powder (EXAMPLE 3) (—emphasis added).

In spite of these disclosures, it would have been obvious to one skilled in the art at the time the invention was made to use the specific weight percent of the additive compound of Amatucci et al in the positive active material of the copending application'923 as the Amatucci et al disclose that positive active materials having such additive weight percent exhibit improved cycle capacity and electrochemical performance. Furthermore, Amatucci et al directly teach the use of additive compound within the claimed range; and with sufficient specificity.

This is a <u>provisional</u> obviousness-type double patenting rejection because the conflicting claims have not in fact been patented.

16. Claims 1-2, 5, 10-11 and 13 are provisionally rejected under the judicially created doctrine of obviousness-type double patenting as being unpatentable over claims 1-10 and 25-37 of copending Application No. 09/897445 (*US Patent Application Publication 2002/0071990*). Although the conflicting claims are not identical, they are not patentably distinct from each other because of the following reasons:

The copending application'445 claims the following (CLAIMS 1-10 and 25-37):

A positive active material for a rechargeable lithium battery comprising

a core comprising at least one lithiated compound; and

a surface-treatment layer on the core comprising at least one coating material selected from the group consisting of coating element included hydroxides, oxyhydroxides, oxycarbonates, hydroxycarbonates and a mixture thereof.

<sup>2.</sup> The positive active material of claim I wherein the lithiated compound is at least one lithiated compound represented by the formulas 1 to

Li <sub>x</sub> Mu <sub>1</sub> , "M' <sub>y</sub> A <sub>2</sub>	$\mathbf{q}$
Li <sub>x</sub> Mn <sub>1-y</sub> M' <sub>y</sub> O <sub>2-y</sub> A <sub>2</sub>	(2
Li <sub>z</sub> Mπ <sub>2</sub> O <sub>4-z</sub> Λ <sub>z</sub>	(3
Li <sub>x</sub> Mn <sub>÷ y</sub> M' <sub>yay</sub>	(4
Li <sub>2</sub> M <sub>1-y</sub> M <sup>4</sup> y <sub>2</sub>	(5
Li <sub>z</sub> MO <sub>1 z</sub> A <sub>z</sub>	(6
Li <sub>x</sub> Ni <sub>1-y</sub> Co <sub>y</sub> O <sub>2-z</sub> A <sub>z</sub>	$\sigma$
Li <sub>a</sub> Ni <sub>1-y-2</sub> Co <sub>4Mv2</sub> A <sub>cc</sub>	(8
Li <sub>x</sub> Ni <sub>1-y-2</sub> Mii <sub>y</sub> M' <sub>2</sub> A <sub>3</sub>	(9
Li <sub>8</sub> Ni <sub>3, v. 2</sub> Co <sub>2</sub> M <sup>4</sup> <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3, q</sub>	(ជ១
Li <sub>z</sub> Ni <sub>z-y</sub> , <sub>z</sub> Mn <sub>y</sub> M' <sub>z</sub> O <sub>z-u</sub> X' ,	(1)
nere	

#### M is Ni or Co.

M' is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Al, Ni, Co. Cr, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Sc, Y, La, Cc, Pr, Nd, Pm, Sm, Eu, Gd, Th, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, Yb, Lu, Ac, Th, Pa, U, Np, Pu, Am, Cm, Bk, Cf, Es, Fm, Md, No aud Lr.

M' is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Al, Cr, Mn, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Se, Y, La, Ce, Pr, Nd, Pm, Sm, Eu, Gd, Tb, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, Yb, Lu, Ac, Th, Pa, U, Np, Pu, Am, Cm, Bk, Cf, Es, Fm, Md, No and Lt,

A is selected from the group consisting of O, F, S and P, and

X is selected from the group consisting of F, S and P.

 The positive active material of claim 1 wherein the coating element of the coating material is soluble in organic solvents or water.

- 4. The positive active material of claim 3 wherein the coating element of the coating material is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Mg, Al, Co, K, Na, Ca, Si, Ti, Sa, V, Ge, Ga, B, As, Zr, and a mixture thereof.
- 5. The positive active material of claim 1 wherein the coating material has amorphous or crystalline form.
- 6. The positive active material of claim 1 wherein the surface- treatment layer has a thickness in the range of 0.1 to 300nm.
- The positive active material of claim 6 wherein the surface-treatment layer has a thickness in the range of 0.1 to 100mm.
- 8. The positive active majorial of claim 7 wherein the surface-treatment layer has a thickness in the range of 0.1 to 50nm.
- 9. The positive active material of claim 1 wherein the content of the coating element of the coating material is 2×10 to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
- 10. The positive active material of claim 9 wherein the content of the coating element of the coating material is 0.001 to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
- 25. A positive active material for a rechargeable lithfum battery comprising
  - a core comprising at least one lithiated compound; and
  - a surface-treatment layer on the core comprising coating element-included-hydroxide or oxyhydroxide.
- 26. The positive active material of claim 25 wherein the lithiated compound is at least one lithiated compound represented by formulas 1 to 11,

ta,Moj.,,M',A;	<b>(3)</b>
Li,Mr, ,M',A, ,A,	(2)
Li <sub>z</sub> Mn <sub>z</sub> O <sub>z-z</sub> A <sub>z</sub>	(3)
Li <sub>2</sub> Mu <sub>2-3</sub> M' <sub>2</sub> A <sub>1</sub>	(4)
Li <sub>x</sub> M <sub>1.1</sub> M' <sub>y</sub> A <sub>3</sub>	(5)
Li,MO, ,A,	(6)
Li <sub>2</sub> Ni <sub>2-y</sub> Co <sub>y</sub> O <sub>y-2</sub> A <sub>y</sub>	(7)
III,Ni <sub>ver</sub> Co <sub>y</sub> M' <sub>y</sub> A <sub>yy</sub>	(8)
LizNi, y Mey Av	(9)
Lighting CogM 207 5Xx	(10)
LigNig May M'zO	(11)
here	

Mais Ni or Co,

M' is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Al, Ni, Co, Cr, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Sc, Y, La, Ce, Pr, Nd, Pm, Sm, Eu, Gd, Tb, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, Yb, Lu, Ac, Th, Pa, U, Np, Pu, Am, Cm, Bk, Cf, Es, Fm, Md, No and Lr, M" is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Al, Cr, Mn, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Sc, Y, La, Ce, Pr, Nd, Pm, Sm, Eu, Gd, Tb, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, Yb, Lu, Ac, Th. Pa, U, Np, Pu, Am, Cm, Bk, Cf, Es, Em, Md, No and Lr,

A is selected from the group consisting of O, F, S and P,

X is selected from the group consisting of F, S and P. 27. The positive active material of claim 25 wherein the coating element of the surface treatment layer is soluble in organic solvents or water.

- 28. The positive active material of claim 25 wherein the coating element of the surface treatment layer is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Mg, Al, Co, K. Na, Ca, Si, Ti, Sn, V, Ge, Ga, B, As, Zr, and a mixture
- 29. The positive active material of claim 25 wherein the coating material has amorphous or crystalline form.
- 30. The positive active material of claim 25 wherein the content of the coating element of the surface-treatment layer is 2×10<sup>-5</sup> to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
- 31. The positive active material of claim 30 wherein the content of the coating element of the surface-treatment layer is 0.001 to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
- 32. A positive active material for a rechargeable lithium battery comprising:
  - a core comprising a lithium-cobalt chalcogenide com-
  - a surface-treatment layer on the core comprising Al(OH), or, AIO(OH).
- 33. The positive active material of claim 32 wherein the content of Al of the surface-treatment layer is 2×10<sup>-5</sup> to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.

Art Unit: 1745

Page 29

- 34. The positive active material of claim 33 wherein the content of Al of the surface-treatment layer is 0.001 to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
- 35. A positive active material for a rechargeable lithium battery comprising:
  - a core comprising a lithium-manganese or lithium-cobalt chalcogenide compound; and
  - a surface-treatment layer on the core comprising IIB(OH).
- 36. The positive active material of claim 35 wherein the content of B of the surface-treatment layer is  $2 \times 10^{-8}$  to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
- 37. The positive active material of claim 36 wherein the content of B of the surface-treatment layer is 0.001 to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.

In this case, the application claims are broader or more generic than the copending application'445 claims, thus, the application claims are anticipated by the copending application'445 claims. Accordingly, a broad limitation/range is anticipated by a narrow limitation/range which lies within the broad limitation. In re Goodman. It is also noted that the specific weight percent of the additive compound is an obvious variation of the claimed invention in the copending application'445 as claims 9-10, 30-31 and 36-37 thereof specifically claims the particular weight percent.

This is a <u>provisional</u> obviousness-type double patenting rejection because the conflicting claims have not in fact been patented.

17. Claims 1-2, 5, 10-11 and 13 are provisionally rejected under the judicially created doctrine of obviousness-type double patenting as being unpatentable over claims 1-10 and 25-37 of copending Application No. 10/627725 (US Patent Application Publication 2004/0018429).

Although the conflicting claims are not identical, they are not patentably distinct from each other because of the following reasons:

The copending application'725 claims the following (CLAIMS 1-10 and 25-37):

- 1. A positive active material for a rechargeable lithium battery comprising
  - a core comprising at least one lithiated compound; and
  - a surface-treatment layer on the core comprising at least one coating material selected from the group consisting of coating element included-hydroxides, oxyhydroxides, oxycarbonates, hydroxycarbonates and a mixture thereof.
- 2. The positive active material of claim 1 wherein the lithiated compound is at least one lithiated compound represented by the formulas 1 to 11,

Li <sub>z</sub> Mn <sub>1-y</sub> M' <sub>y</sub> A <sub>2</sub>	(1)
$\operatorname{Li}_{\mathbf{x}}\operatorname{Mn}_{(-\mathbf{y})}\operatorname{M}'_{\mathbf{y}}\operatorname{O}_{(-\mathbf{z})}\operatorname{A}_{\mathbf{z}}$	(2)
Li <sub>z</sub> Mn <sub>2</sub> O <sub>4-2</sub> A <sub>2</sub>	(3)
$\operatorname{Li}_{\mathbf{x}}\operatorname{Mn}_{\mathbf{x}_{\mathbf{y}}}\operatorname{M}_{\mathbf{y}}^{\prime}A_{\mathbf{q}}$	(4)
Li <sub>z</sub> M <sub>1-y</sub> M" <sub>y</sub> A <sub>2</sub>	(5)
Li <sub>s</sub> MO <sub>1-x</sub> A <sub>z</sub>	(6)
$\text{Li}_{2}\text{Ni}_{1-y}\text{Co}_{y}\text{O}_{2-x}\text{A}_{2}$	(7)
Li <sub>x</sub> Ni <sub>3-y-z</sub> Co <sub>y</sub> M* <sub>z</sub> A <sub>4</sub>	(8)

																										9)	
																										(i)	
																										1)	

where

0.95 mx 1.1, 0 my 20.5, 0 mz 20.5, 0 m 60 m2,

M is Ni or Co,

- M' is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Al, Ni, Co, Cr, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Sc, Y, Lia, Ce, Pr, Nd, Pm, Sm, Eu, Gd, Tb, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, Yb, Lu, Ac, Th, Pu, U, Np, Pu, Am, Cm, Bk, Cl, Es, Fm, Md, No and Lr,
- M' is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Al, Cr, Mn, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Se, Y, La, Ce, Pr, Nd, Pin, Sm, Eu, Gid, Th, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, Yh, Lu, Ac, Th, Ps, U, Np, Fu, Am, Cm, Bk, Cf, Es, Fm, Md, No and Lr,
- A is selected from the group consisting of O, F, S and P, and
- X is selected from the group consisting of F, S and P.
- The positive active material of claim 1 wherein the coating element of the coating material is soluble in organic solvents or water.
- 4. The positive active material of claim 3 wherein the coating element of the coating material is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Mg, Al, Co, K. Na, Ca, Si, Ti, Sn, V, Ge, Ga, B, As, Zr, and a mixture thereof.
- 5. The positive active material of claim 1 wherein the coating material has amorphous or crystalline form.
- 6. The positive active material of claim 1 wherein the surface-treatment layer has a thickness in the range of 0.1 to 300 nm.

- 7. The positive active material of claim 6 wherein the surface-treatment layer has a thickness in the range of 0.1 to 100 nm.
- 8. The positive active material of claim 7 wherein the surface-treatment layer has a thickness in the range of 0.1 to 50 mm.
- 9. The positive active material of claim 1 wherein the content of the conting element of the coating material is 2×10 to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
- 10. The positive active material of claim 9 wherein the content of the coating element of the coating material is 0.001 to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
  - 25. A positive active material for a rechargeable lithium battery comprising
    - a core comprising at least one lithrated compound; and
    - a surface-treatment layer on the core comprising coating element-included-hydroxide or oxyhydroxide.
  - 26. The positive active material of claim 25 wherein the lithiated compound is at least one lithiated compound represented by formulas 1 to 11,

Li <sub>x</sub> Mn <sub>t-2</sub> M',A,	(1)
Li <sub>x</sub> Ma <sub>1</sub> M' <sub>y</sub> O <sub>2</sub> A <sub>2</sub>	(2)
Ii,Ma,O,,A,	(6)
Li <sub>x</sub> Mn <sub>2-y</sub> M' <sub>x</sub> A <sub>4</sub>	(4)
Li <sub>2</sub> M <sub>2-3</sub> M <sup>2</sup> 3A <sub>2</sub>	(5)
Li <sub>x</sub> MO <sub>2-x</sub> A <sub>4</sub>	(6)
Li,Ni,_,Co,O,_,A,	$\sigma$
LizNi, y ,Co,M*,A,	(8)
LigNigger, Mu <sub>p</sub> M' <sub>2</sub> A <sub>4</sub>	(9)
LizNizzy Co.M"zOz X	(10)
Li <sub>k</sub> Ni <sub>s-x-e</sub> Mn <sub>y</sub> M' <sub>x</sub> O <sub>2-e</sub> X <sub>ee</sub>	(11)
vhere	

 $0.95 \le x \le 1.1$ ,  $0 \le y \le 0.5$ ,  $0 \le z \le 0.5$ ,  $0 \le \alpha \le 2$ ,

M is Ni or Co.

M is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Al, Ni, Co, Cr, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Sc, Y, La, Ce, Pr, Nd, Pm, Sm, Eu, Gd, Tb, Dy, Ho, Er, Tm, Yb, Lu, Ac, Th, Pa, U, Np, Pu, Am, Cm, Bk, Cf, Es, I'm, Md, No and Lr,

M" is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Al, Cr, Mn, Fe, Mg, Sr, V, Sc, Y, La, Ce, Pr. Nd. Pm. Sm. Eu. Gd. Tb. Dy. Ho. Er. Tm. Yb. Lu. Ac, Th. Pa, U, Np, Pu, Am, Cm, Bk, Cl, Es, Fm, Md, No and Lr.

A is selected from the group consisting of O, F, S and P,

X is selected from the group consisting of F, S and P.

Art Unit: 1745

27. The positive active material of claim 25 wherein the coating element of the surface treatment layer is soluble in organic solvents or water.

28. The positive active material of claim 25 wherein the coating element of the surface treatment layer is at least one element selected from the group consisting of Mg, Al, Co, K, Na, Ca, Si, Ti, Sn, V, Ge, Ga, B, As, Zr, and a mixture thereof.

29. The positive active material of claim 25 wherein the coating material has amorphous or crystalline form

- 30. The positive active material of claim 25 wherein the content of the coating element of the surface-treatment layer is  $2 \times 10^{-5}$  to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
- 31. The positive active material of claim 30 wherein the content of the coating element of the surface-treatment layer is 0.001 to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
- 32. A positive active material for a rechargeable lithium hattery comprising:
  - core comprising a lithium-cobalt chalcogenide compound; and
  - a surface-treatment layer on the core comprising  $\Delta I(OH)_3$  or,  $\Delta IO(OH)$ .
- 33. The positive active material of claim 32 wherein the content of Al of the surface-treatment layer is 2×10<sup>-5</sup> to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
- 34. The positive active material of claim 33 wherein the content of Al of the surface-treatment layer is 0.001 to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
- 35. A positive active material for a rechargeable lithium battery comprising:
  - a core comprising a lithium-manganese or lithium-cobalt chalcogenide compound; and
  - a surface-freatment layer on the core comprising HB(OH)...
- 36. The positive active material of claim 35 wherein the content of H of the surface-treatment layer is 2×10<sup>-5</sup> to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.
- 37. The positive active material of claim 36 wherein the content of B of the surface-treatment layer is 0.001 to 2 percent by weight based on the weight of the positive active material.

In this case, the application claims are broader or more generic than the copending application'725 claims, thus, the application claims are anticipated by the copending application'725 claims. Accordingly, a broad limitation/range is anticipated by a narrow limitation/range which lies within the broad limitation. In re Goodman. It is also noted that the specific weight percent of the additive compound is an obvious variation of the claimed invention

in the copending application'725 as claims 9-10, 30-31 and 36-37 thereof specifically claims the particular weight percent.

This is a <u>provisional</u> obviousness-type double patenting rejection because the conflicting claims have not in fact been patented.

# Response to Arguments

- 18. Applicant's arguments filed 08/12/05 have been considered in their entirety but they are unpersuasive.
- 19. (new response) The main contention of applicant's arguments is premised on the assertion that the primary reference "fails to teach or suggest an amorphous additive compound" (See amendment of 08/12/05 at page 9, 5th full paragraph) because "Amatucci discloses using a film for coating... wherein the suitable materials for such coating film are either in a crystalline or glassy form, such as borates or aluminates (column 4, lines 9-15)" (See amendment of 08/12/05 at page 9, 3rd full paragraph). First of all, the examiner likes to point out that applicants have admitted that the prior art of record does use glassy form materials for coating. In this regard, applicants are then respectfully requested to double check and review their assertion, and thus, re-evaluate and reconsider their position because those of ordinary skill in the art know that a glassy material (glass) stands for any of various amorphous materials formed from a melt by cooling to rigidity without crystallization (Refer to Merriam-Webster's, Collegiate Dictionary, 10th Edition). Thus, a glassy material does not crystallize, thereby, it does not possess a crystalline structure. Simply put, glassy materials are amorphous materials. Hence, applicant's

Art Unit: 1745

arguments with respect to the lack of an amorphous additive compound are in error and completely inapposite.

The following responses to arguments were presented in the previous office action and are herein maintained for the reasons of record.

20. Since applicants have overcome the 35 USC 102 rejection, the examiner will only address applicants' arguments concerning the 35 USC 103 rejection. In this regard, the principal contention of applicant's arguments is premised on the assertion that the prior art of record fails to reveal the specific amount (weight percent) of additive compound in the positive electrode. However, this assertion is not sufficient to overcome the rejection because the prior art (i.e. Amatucci et al'291 and the JP'813 publication) in combination does disclose the use of additive compound within the claimed range. Indeed, applicants' attention is particularly directed to *EXAMPLES 1-3* in the Amatucci et al reference. Those examples clearly show using the specific claimed amount of additive compound in the positive electrode. Applicant is reminded that the test for obviousness is what the combined teachings of the references would have suggested to those of ordinary skill in the art. See *In re Keller*, 642 F.2d 413, 208 USPQ 871 (CCPA 1981).

Therefore, in view of the foregoing teachings, the examiner believes that it is fairly reasonable to contend that those of ordinary skill in the art would have sufficient sophistication to recognize that the specific additive compound of the JP'813 publication may be added by using exactly the same amount/percent as disclosed in Amatucci et al'291. Simply put, given that Amatucci et al'291 evidently teaches the use of an additive compound within the claimed range, the skilled artisan will only need to substitute the JP'813 publication additive in the positive

electrode of Amatucci et al'291. Stated somewhat differently, not because Amatucci et al'291 fail to disclose the specific additive compound (the material) per se, it means that the additive compound of the JP'813 publication cannot be added in the same manner and amount as Amatucci et al'291 instruct to add their additive compounds, that is to say, nothing in the Amatucci et al'291 reference precludes the use of other additive compounds, in particular, the additive compounds of the JP'813 publication. Thus, in the event that applicants eventually argue that the examiner's position is improper, applicant is now advised that showing of objective evidence would be necessary to demonstrate that the use of the additive compound of the JP'813 publication, when used as taught (i.e. in the same amount/proportion) in Amatucci et al'291, would cause detrimental or deleterious damage(s) to the positive active material of Amatucci et al'291. Therefore, the burden would be shifted to the applicants to provide such objective evidence.

21. Applicant's arguments do not comply with 37 CFR 1.111(c) because they do not clearly point out the patentable novelty which he or she thinks the claims present in view of the state of the art disclosed by the references cited or the objections made. Further, they do not show how the amendments avoid such references or objections.

#### Conclusion

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Raymond Alejandro whose telephone number is (571) 272-1282. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday-Thursday (8:00 am - 6:30 pm).

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Patrick J. Ryan can be reached on (571) 272-1292. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

Raymond Alejandro Primary Examiner Art Unit 1745

ORGINALE IA CHOMYAR